



**STATE OF HAWAII
HAWAII TEACHER STANDARDS BOARD
TEACHER EDUCATION COMMITTEE MEETING**

MINUTES

Remote Technology via Zoom

650 Iwilei Road, Suite 158
Honolulu, HI 96817

Friday, November 14, 2025

PRESENT IN-PERSON:

Dr. Jonathan Gillentine, Committee Chair
Kristi Miyamae, Ex Officio Committee Member, Board Chair

PRESENT ONLINE:

Dr. Jamie Simpson Steele for Dr. Nathan Murata, Committee Vice Chair
Sean Bacon, in place of Dr. Tammi Oyadomari-Chun for Keith Hayashi, Committee Member
Dion Dizon for Dr. Mark Sung Alapaki Luke, Committee Member
Dawn Raymond, Committee Member
Dondra Ozaki, Ex Officio Committee Member, Board Vice Chair

EXCUSED:

Kahele Dukelow for Roy Takumi, Committee Member
Dale Matsuura, Committee Member

STAFF:

Felicia Villalobos, Board Executive Director
Steven Harada, Licensing Specialist
Dr. Mitzie Higa, Licensing Specialist
Tracey Idica, NBCT, Licensing Specialist
Kaulana Molina, NBCT, Licensing Specialist
Kris Murakami, Esq., Licensing Specialist
Dr. Jennifer Padua, Licensing Specialist

I. CALL TO ORDER

A. ROLL CALL TO ESTABLISH QUORUM

Committee Chair Dr. Jonathan Gillentine called the Hawai'i Teacher Standards Board ("HTSB") Teacher Education Committee ("Committee") meeting to order at 10:00 a.m.

Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine shared information regarding procedures for virtual committee meetings, then called roll call and established quorum. Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine and Ex Officio Committee Member Kristi Miyamae were present in-person. Committee Member Dawn Raymond, Ex Officio Committee Member Dondra Ozaki, and Assistant Superintendent ("AS") Sean Bacon were present online. Committee Members Kahele Dukelow and Dale Matsuura were excused. Committee Vice Chair Dr. Jamie Simpson Steele and Committee Member Dion Dizon were not present at roll call.

Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine shared information regarding non-public site disclosure. None of the Committee Members participating online had anyone present with them. Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine shared additional information regarding meeting protocols and procedures.

B. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON COMMITTEE AGENDA ITEMS

On-time and late written testimonies were submitted and posted to HTSB's website. One additional late written testimony submitted the morning of the Committee meeting was reviewed on-screen during the meeting.

Committee Member Dizon joined the meeting remotely via Zoom.

Kahea Faria, representing 'Aha Kauleo Statewide Council for Ka Papahana Kaiapuni, testified in-person on NBI 25-17: Guidelines for Evidence Submission for SATEP Compliance and Program Modifications or Changes. She requested deferring the New Business Item ("NBI") to allow additional time for clarification, dialogue, and collaboration with HTSB staff.

Kahea Faria, representing herself, testified in-person on NBI 25-17: Guidelines for Evidence Submission for SATEP Compliance and Program Modifications or Changes. She expressed concerns regarding negative impacts on state approved teacher education programs ("SATEPs") and broader effects on teacher candidates, schools, communities, and the state. She mentioned NBI 13-09 and her experience with the program modification process.

Aaron Levine, from the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa ("UHM") College of Education ("COE") School of Teacher Education, testified online via Zoom on NBI 25-17: Guidelines for Evidence Submission for SATEP Compliance and Program Modifications or Changes. He requested deferring the NBI to allow additional time for discussion and clarification with HTSB staff, emphasizing that an NBI was more useful when all stakeholders had the opportunity to provide input.

Jon Yoshioka, from the UHM COE School of Teacher Education, testified online via Zoom on NBI 25-17: Guidelines for Evidence Submission for SATEP Compliance and Program Modifications or Changes. He requested deferring the NBI to allow additional time for review, clarification, and collaboration with HTSB staff, stating the NBI also seemed to extend beyond the scope of what was currently allowed.

UNAPPROVED

C. ANNOUNCEMENTS

Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine welcomed Committee Member Dizon.

D. APPROVAL OF COMMITTEE MINUTES

The minutes of the August 8, 2025, and September 12, 2025, meetings were approved as written.

II. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON COMMITTEE AGENDA ITEMS

On-time and late written testimonies were submitted. No one else signed up for online or in-person public testimony.

III. ACTION / DISCUSSION ITEMS

A. NBI 23-24 Revised: Imposed Moratorium for Preparation Providers Seeking Initial Program Approval

Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine reviewed NBI 23-24 Revised, highlighting that it would be effective immediately if approved by the full board ("Board").

Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine asked the Committee if there were any questions or discussion.

AS Bacon clarified that the Board was seeking an extension for a third year for this moratorium. He asked if there was data on educator preparation programs ("EPPs") who were seeking initial approval but were unable to due to the moratorium. Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine deferred to Executive Director ("ED") Villalobos. ED Villalobos answered there were inquiries pertaining to the federal State Authorization Reciprocity Agreement ("SARA") law, but not directly related to program application reviews. Committee Member Dizon asked if these inquiries were mostly from out-of-state ("OOS") programs. ED Villalobos answered yes, and that the moratorium did not impact HTSB's currently approved EPPs. She clarified that in-state programs not approved by the Board were considered OOS programs due to not having gone through the state approval process with HTSB.

AS Bacon asked if the moratorium was necessary as no programs were seeking approval. Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine deferred to ED Villalobos. ED Villalobos communicated the uncertainty of the future, the strain that initial program approval applications put on HTSB staff, and the desire to focus on the currently approved EPPs, who also participated in HTSB's workgroups. AS Bacon expressed concerns about the teacher shortage and reservations about extending the moratorium, mentioning the need for various teacher licensure pathways while still maintaining quality.

Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine asked the Committee if there were any further questions or discussion. There were no further questions or discussion from the Committee.

Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine called for a roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 23-24 Revised, as written, to the Board at the general business meeting scheduled at 11:00 a.m. Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine did not vote. AS Bacon voted not to recommend. All other Committee Members present voted to recommend.

ACTION — The Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-24 Revised, as written, to the Board, with four Committee Members present voting aye and one Committee Member voting nay.

B. NBI 11-03 Revised: Criteria for Satisfying HTSB’s Clinical Experience Options

Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine reviewed NBI 11-03 Revised, highlighting its updated Rationale/Background.

Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine asked the Committee if there were any questions or discussion.

Committee Member Raymond asked if there was a timeline for Pearson’s assessment revision. Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine deferred to ED Villalobos. ED Villalobos answered it would take a while, so HTSB staff would touch base with Pearson again once the Educational Teacher Performance Assessment (“edTPA”) was revised. She shared that while no one used Option C before, a viable option would still be available in the future.

Committee Member Dizon asked if there was a way to preserve Option C pending Pearson’s revision or finding another provider. Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine deferred to ED Villalobos. ED Villalobos answered the revised edTPA would be a new test with new score cuts that the Board would need to vote on for adoption, like the Educational Testing Service (“ETS”) Praxis exam. She shared that HTSB currently had a contract with ETS but not with Pearson, so that contract would need to be renewed.

AS Bacon wanted confirmation that no one currently in a program was trying to use Option C. Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine deferred to ED Villalobos. ED Villalobos stated the edTPA currently was not part of any HTSB-approved EPP, and that this would mostly affect OOS applicants who had the edTPA as part of their state licensure requirements.

Committee Member Dizon asked if this would impact the registered teacher apprenticeship program. Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine deferred to ED Villalobos. ED Villalobos answered the test was not used for licensing and the apprenticeship program was looking at using HTSB-approved EPPs, so it would not be impacted.

Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine asked the Committee if there were any further questions or discussion. There were no further questions or discussion from the Committee.

Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine called for a roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 11-03 Revised, as written, to the Board at the general business meeting scheduled at 11:00 a.m. Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine did not vote. All other Committee Members present voted to recommend.

ACTION — The Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 11-03 Revised, as written, to the Board, with five Committee Members present voting aye.

C. NBI 25-16: HTSB Recognition of Apprenticeship Program Hours and Content Knowledge Requirement

Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine reviewed NBI 25-16, highlighting the Rationale/Background.

Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine asked the Committee if there were any questions or discussion.

Committee Member Raymond asked if this NBI indicated that the funding came through. Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine stated he did not think so but deferred to ED Villalobos. ED Villalobos answered HTSB did not receive the funding yet. She explained the NBI stemmed from stakeholders' concern about teacher candidates' 450 hours as required in Hawaii Administrative Rules ("HAR") versus the registered teacher apprenticeship program's 2,000 hours of on-the-job training.

Committee Member Dizon asked who would be running the apprenticeship program, as trade unions often ran their registered apprenticeships. Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine deferred to ED Villalobos. ED Villalobos answered HTSB was currently the sponsor but would report back to the State Apprenticeship Committee ("SAC") within the Department of Labor and Industrial Relations ("DLIR") Workforce Development Division. She shared that the registered teacher apprenticeship program also had its own council comprised of various stakeholders such as the Hawai'i Government Employees Association ("HGEA") and the Hawai'i State Teachers Association ("HSTA").

Committee Member Ozaki asked if the 2,000 hours were for paid on-the-job training or if it also included related technical instruction. Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine stated he believed it was the latter but deferred to ED Villalobos, who deferred to Licensing Specialist ("LS") Dr. Mitzie Higa. LS Higa answered the 2,000 hours referred to paid on-the-job training.

Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine asked the Committee if there were any further questions or discussion. There were no further questions or discussion from the Committee.

Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine called for a roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 25-16, as written, to the Board at the general business meeting scheduled at 11:00 a.m. Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine did not vote. All other Committee Members present voted to recommend.

ACTION — The Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 25-16, as written, to the Board, with five Committee Members present voting aye.

D. NBI 25-17: Guidelines for Evidence Submission for SATEP Compliance and Program Modifications or Changes

Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine reviewed NBI 25-17, highlighting that there were questions at the previous board meeting pertaining to the definition of 'evidence.'

Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine asked the Committee if there were any questions or discussion.

Ex Officio Committee Member Miyamae asked if LS Kris Murakami, Esq., who was previously the Board's Deputy Attorney General ("DAG"), could explain the Board's HAR requirements. Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine deferred to LS Murakami. LS Murakami stated HAR subchapter 6 was signed by former Governor Ige on August 26, 2019. She highlighted HAR §8-54-18, emphasizing that the Board had regulatory authority per Governor mandate. She stated the Board could not adopt this NBI, but it would then be the Board's decision to determine if provided evidence was satisfactory or deemed substantive or minor changes.

Ex Officio Committee Member Miyamae shared that she had the opportunity to sit on a program review panel. She asked if LS Dr. Jennifer Padua could explain how the review panels used evidence as mentioned in this NBI. Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine deferred to LS Padua. LS Padua explained the criteria for potential review panelists, highlighting that HTSB's role was to facilitate the program review process. She shared that she provided them with training on HAR requirements and any Board-adopted program standards, then they independently reviewed evidence such as course syllabi before reconvening with comments and questions, which she then summarized in writing for the Board.

Committee Member Dizon asked about the weight put on evidence, as course syllabi were between students and the professor. Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine deferred to ED Villalobos. ED Villalobos clarified that evidence was reviewed to ensure that required components were present. She then deferred to LS Padua. LS Padua clarified that, with course syllabi, the program review panel checked that teacher candidate performance and content standards were addressed.

Committee Member Dizon asked if HTSB staff would offer technical support for EPPs feeling additional burden due to this NBI. Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine deferred to ED Villalobos. ED Villalobos clarified that HTSB's workgroups helped form recommendations for policies or requirements that the Board could adopt, while this NBI was intended to provide examples of evidence. Committee Member Dizon acknowledged HTSB's statutory priorities and duties, but she questioned if these paper processes took away from the main purpose of quality instruction and student outcomes. ED Villalobos stated HTSB archived these documents so that if anything arose (e.g., inquiries from other state licensing agencies, teacher candidates claiming an EPP did not prepare them correctly) there were documents verifying the EPP was well-vetted. AS Bacon stated it seemed unclear to the EPPs that this NBI was intended to only provide examples. He stated he would suggest deferring this NBI until HTSB staff could meet with the EPPs to answer questions and collaborate.

Committee Member Raymond asked how deferring this NBI would impact HTSB's current work. Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine deferred to ED Villalobos. ED Villalobos answered she would need direction from the Board on next steps for soliciting more information. She stated there were programs asking for review and modification, but it would be best to pause those if there was no agreement on examples of evidence. Ex Officio Committee Member Miyamae expressed her preference for taking a stance on this NBI as it was not compliance but only providing examples.

Ex Officio Committee Member Ozaki asked if the Board would consider adjusting some wording in the NBI to include '*examples*' as there was confusion. Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine stated the NBI could be amended. Committee Member Dizon stated even with adding '*examples*,' the current wording of the NBI did not come across as guidance since there was mention of proving compliance. She stated, as written, she would defer this NBI. AS Bacon stated he thought there was good intent, but he would like to see HTSB and the EPPs work closely to come to an agreement. He suggested a training to help implement this NBI if it was approved, but he would still suggest deferring it.

Ex Officio Committee Member Ozaki made a motion to amend NBI 25-17 with clearer language indicating examples. Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine suggested the language, '*Will serve as examples.*' Ex Officio Committee Member Ozaki agreed to include this in her motion. (Ozaki / Raymond)

UNAPPROVED

Ex Officio Committee Member Miyamae asked if LS Murakami could provide additional information. Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine deferred to LS Murakami. LS Murakami stated there seemed to be confusion based on the NBI's title and suggested renaming it with clearer language indicating examples. Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine thanked LS Murakami and returned the discussion to the current motion on the floor.

Committee Member Dizon suggested further amending the NBI with additional language regarding HTSB's statutory priorities of effective teaching and student success. Ex Officio Committee Member Ozaki agreed to include this additional language in her motion.

Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine asked the Committee if there were any further questions or discussion on the amended language. There were no further questions or discussion from the Committee.

Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine called for a roll call vote on whether or not to approve the amended language for NBI 25-17. Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine did not vote. Committee Vice Chair Dr. Simpson Steele had joined the meeting remotely via Zoom during discussion. She and AS Bacon voted not to approve the amended language. The four other Committee Members present voted to approve.

Committee Member Raymond made a motion to amend the title of NBI 25-17 as suggested by LS Murakami. (Raymond / Dizon)

Committee Member Dizon suggested simplifying LS Murakami's provided language; however, as that would change the motion, she withdrew her second. Committee Member Raymond agreed with Committee Member Dizon and withdrew her motion. She then deferred to Committee Member Dizon's suggestion.

Committee Member Dizon made a motion to amend the title of NBI 25-17 with simpler language indicating examples. (Dizon / Raymond)

Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine asked the Committee if there were any questions or discussion on the amended title.

AS Bacon stated he still questioned if this NBI was necessary, as perhaps some type of training or additional clarifications with HTSB and the EPPs could be more beneficial. Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine returned the discussion to the current motion on the floor. Committee Vice Chair Dr. Simpson Steele stated she did not object the amendments, but she was not comfortable voting for them as she felt that testimony requests for collaboration were not addressed. Committee Member Dizon clarified that the amendments captured information shared by ED Villalobos, LS Murakami, and LS Padua.

Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine asked the Committee if there were any further questions or discussion on the amended title. There were no further questions or discussion from the Committee.

Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine called for a roll call vote on whether or not to approve the amended title for NBI 25-17. Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine did not vote. Committee Vice Chair Dr. Simpson Steele and AS Bacon voted not to approve. The four other Committee Members present voted to approve.

UNAPPROVED

Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine asked the Committee if there were any questions or discussion on NBI 25-17 as a whole. There were no questions or discussion from the Committee.

Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine called for a roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 25-17, as amended, to the Board at the general business meeting scheduled at 11:00 a.m. Committee Vice Chair Dr. Simpson Steele, Committee Member Dizon, and AS Bacon voted not to recommend. Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine and the three other Committee Members present voted to recommend.

ACTION — The Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 25-17, as amended, to the Board, with four Committee Members present voting aye and three Committee Members voting nay.

IV. ADJOURNMENT

Committee Chair Dr. Gillentine adjourned the Teacher Education Committee Meeting at 11:40 a.m.

UNAPPROVED

List of people who submitted written testimony before the meeting

| <i>ON-TIME TESTIMONY</i> | | |
|---------------------------------|--|--|
| NAME | ORGANIZATION | AGENDA ITEM |
| Kahele Dukelow | University of Hawai'i Community Colleges – Interim Associate Vice President for Academic Affairs | III.D. NBI 25-17: Guidelines for Evidence Submission for SATEP Compliance and Program Modifications or Changes |
| Kau'i Sang | | III.D. NBI 25-17: Guidelines for Evidence Submission for SATEP Compliance and Program Modifications or Changes |

| <i>LATE TESTIMONY</i> | | |
|------------------------------|---|--|
| NAME | ORGANIZATION | AGENDA ITEM |
| Dr. Nathan Murata | Teacher Education Coordinating Committee – Chair; University of Hawai'i at Mānoa – Dean, College of Education | III.D. NBI 25-17: Guidelines for Evidence Submission for SATEP Compliance and Program Modifications or Changes |
| Kananinohea Māka'imoku | 'Aha Kauleo Statewide Council for Ka Papahana Kaiapuni – Chair | III.D. NBI 25-17: Guidelines for Evidence Submission for SATEP Compliance and Program Modifications or Changes |
| Kahea Faria | University of Hawai'i at Mānoa College of Education, School of Teacher Education | III.D. NBI 25-17: Guidelines for Evidence Submission for SATEP Compliance and Program Modifications or Changes |